# [Emirates Journal for Engineering Research](https://scholarworks.uaeu.ac.ae/ejer)

[Volume 29](https://scholarworks.uaeu.ac.ae/ejer/vol29) | [Issue 1](https://scholarworks.uaeu.ac.ae/ejer/vol29/iss1) Article 4

3-17-2024

# A 4-Node Shell Finite Element based on Assumed Bending and Membrane Strains for Static Analysis of Plates and Shells

sifeddine abderrahmani University of Echahid Cheikh Larbi Tebessi, Algeria, abderrahmani\_1989@yahoo.com

Follow this and additional works at: [https://scholarworks.uaeu.ac.ae/ejer](https://scholarworks.uaeu.ac.ae/ejer?utm_source=scholarworks.uaeu.ac.ae%2Fejer%2Fvol29%2Fiss1%2F4&utm_medium=PDF&utm_campaign=PDFCoverPages) 

Part of the [Civil Engineering Commons](https://network.bepress.com/hgg/discipline/252?utm_source=scholarworks.uaeu.ac.ae%2Fejer%2Fvol29%2Fiss1%2F4&utm_medium=PDF&utm_campaign=PDFCoverPages), [Computational Engineering Commons,](https://network.bepress.com/hgg/discipline/311?utm_source=scholarworks.uaeu.ac.ae%2Fejer%2Fvol29%2Fiss1%2F4&utm_medium=PDF&utm_campaign=PDFCoverPages) and the [Structural](https://network.bepress.com/hgg/discipline/256?utm_source=scholarworks.uaeu.ac.ae%2Fejer%2Fvol29%2Fiss1%2F4&utm_medium=PDF&utm_campaign=PDFCoverPages)  [Engineering Commons](https://network.bepress.com/hgg/discipline/256?utm_source=scholarworks.uaeu.ac.ae%2Fejer%2Fvol29%2Fiss1%2F4&utm_medium=PDF&utm_campaign=PDFCoverPages) 

#### Recommended Citation

abderrahmani, sifeddine (2024) "A 4-Node Shell Finite Element based on Assumed Bending and Membrane Strains for Static Analysis of Plates and Shells," Emirates Journal for Engineering Research: Vol. 29: Iss. 1, Article 4.

Available at: [https://scholarworks.uaeu.ac.ae/ejer/vol29/iss1/4](https://scholarworks.uaeu.ac.ae/ejer/vol29/iss1/4?utm_source=scholarworks.uaeu.ac.ae%2Fejer%2Fvol29%2Fiss1%2F4&utm_medium=PDF&utm_campaign=PDFCoverPages)

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by Scholarworks@UAEU. It has been accepted for inclusion in Emirates Journal for Engineering Research by an authorized editor of Scholarworks@UAEU. For more information, please contact [EJER@uaeu.ac.ae.](mailto:EJER@uaeu.ac.ae)

# **A 4-Node Shell Finite Element based on Assumed Bending and Membrane Strains for Static Analysis of Plates and Shells** SIFEDDINE ABDERRAHMANI

Laboratory of Applied Civil Engineering (LGCA), Department of civil engineering, University of Echahid Cheikh Larbi Tebessi, Algeria, e-mail: (sifeddine.abderrahmani@univ-tebessa.dz) (Received 06 December 2023 and Accepted on 17 March 2024)

#### **Abstract**

In this paper the development of a new rectangular flat shell element is proposed. This element is called SBRPK-SBRIE. This element is used in the numerical analysis of thin structures based on the strain approach with linear elastic behavior. Combining bending and membrane elements yields the proposed element.The strain-based rectangular finite element for the thin plate bending element denoted SBRPK, and the strain-based membrane element denoted SBRIE. Several numerical examples have been conducted to assess the accuracy and reliability of the developed element compared with the theoretical results and other finite elements. Obtained results show its good performance compared to other elements in the literature.

**Keywords:** Flat shell element, Membrane element, Plate bending element, Strain approach, Thin structures

#### **1 Introduction**

Today, finite elements are used in most areas of engineering, from calculations of electromagnetic radiation from antennas to the fluid-structure interaction between the sea and a sailboat. It was in the field of structural mechanics that the Finite Element Method (FEM) was discovered and, even today, it is in this field that it is the most widely used and where the amount of research work is the greatest. This method as known today was presented in 1956 by Turner, Clough, Martin and Topp [1] and was first applied to the analysis of aircraft structural problems. Simultaneously, a new approach to the elements has been developed at Cardiff University (U.K.), known as the strain approach. This approach has been applied by Sabir and Ashwell [2], to develop a new class of elements for plane elasticity problems in Cartesian coordinates, then Sabir (1983) to develop a new class of elements for general elasticity problems [3], [4]. Belarbi and Maalem have developed a new element with static condensation for plane elasticity [5]. In 2016, Hamadi et al developed a new finite element for plane elasticity problems [6]. For plate bending problems, Belarbi and Charif have developed a hexahedral finite element "SBH8" based on the strain approach [7]. Belounar and Guenfoud formulated a new element for bending thick plates [8]. In 2016, Abderrahmani et al developed a finite element for bending thin plates [9], [10]. For the modeling of the shells, Belarbi (2000) formulated a flat quadrilateral shell element named ACM-SBQ4, obtained by superimposing the standard membrane element SBQ4 with the plate bending element ACM [11] , After that, in 2007, A.I. Mousa and M.H. El Naggar developed a new spherical rectangular finite element based on the formulation of lowered shells [12]. Abed-Meraim et al. (2013) new quadratic solid–shell elements and their evaluation on linear benchmark problems [13]. Hamadi et al. developed a finite element model for thin-shell structure linear analysis. [14]. Yan et al [26] proposed the HDF-HSF quadrilateral flat shell element, which was created by combining a hybrid displacement function plate bending element with a hybrid stress function membrane element. After that, in 2018, Guenfoud

et al developed a new triangular thin flat shell finite element with drilling rotation based on the strain approach[27]. In 2019 Labiodh et al developed a new triangular finite element called DKT18RF, is a shell type element without rotation degree of freedom [15]. Simultaneously, Sangtarash et al. proposed a novel four-node quadrilateral element for shell structure analysis [28]. Sangtarash et al (2020) also developed a new three-node triangular Mindlin– Reissner flat shell element [29].

Numerical analysis of shell structures in large-scale industrial problems is always a challenge and received on an ongoing based on strong interest. Over the past three decades, finite element method (FEM) has been used as a numerical tool powerful to simulate the behavior of shell structures.

Shell elements are widely used to model curved geometry structures, they are based on classical shell theory and are very efficient, but difficult to develop. There are four types of shell elements: planar elements, curved elements, solid and axisymmetric elements. These elements can be classified according to the thickness of the shell and curvature of the average sheet. Planar shell elements were developed by combining membrane elements and plate bending elements. Reasoning by the superposition of two elements (flexural and membrane) [16].

This paper presents the formulation of a new flat shell strain based rectangular shell element called SBRPK-SBRIE for the analysis of thin structure. The element is obtained by superposition of the strain-based membrane element (SBRIE) and the strain based rectangular plate bending element (SBRPK). We used numerical problems to evaluate the performance of the proposed flat shell element. The result were very encouraging.

# **2 Formulation**

The proposed rectangular shell element is a combination of a (**SBRIE)** strain based membrane element and (**SBRPK)** strain based plate bending element. The stiffness matrix of the shell element **SBRPK-SBRIE** is a combination of those elements, as shown in Fig.1

The shell elements generally have six degrees of freedom (d.o.f) in each node:

 $u_i$ ,  $v_i$ ,  $w_i$  Are the translations d.o.f

 $\theta_{xi}$ ,  $\theta_{yi}$  Are the rotations d.o.f

 $\theta_{xi}$  Fictive rotation



Plate bending element (SBRPK)



**=**



Flat shell element (SBRPK-SBRIE)

#### **Figure 1: Construction of the shell element (SBRPK-SBRIE)**

The bending stiffness matrix for each node is of order 3x3 and is symbolized by  $\left[K_f\right]_{3x3}$ .

The membrane stiffness matrix for each node is of order 2x2 and is represented by $[K_m]_{2x2}$ .

The stiffness matrix for each node of the shell element is of order 6x6 can thus be represented by  $[K_c]_{6x6}$ .

$$
[K_c]_{6x6} = \begin{bmatrix} [K_m]_{2x2} & [0]_{2x3} & 0 \\ [0]_{3x2} & [K_f]_{3x3} & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & K_r \end{bmatrix}
$$
Or:

 $K_r$ : is the value of the fictitious stiffness added in each node.

# **2.1 Bending element (SBRPK)**

Abderrahmani et al. [9] have developed a new rectangular finite element for thin plate bending based on the strain approach, with four nodes and 12 degrees of freedom, called SBRPK. As shown in Fig. 2. Analytical integration was used to evaluate the element stiffness matrix.

The displacement field:

$$
w = a_1 - a_2x - a_3y - a_4\frac{x^2}{2} - a_5\frac{x^3}{6} - a_6\frac{x^2y}{2} - a_7\frac{x^3y}{6} - a_8\frac{y^2}{2} - a_9\frac{xy^2}{2} - a_{10}\frac{y^3}{6} - a_{11}\frac{xy^3}{6} - a_{12}\frac{xy}{2}
$$
\n(1a)\n
$$
\beta_x = a_2 + a_4x + a_5\frac{x^2}{2} + a_6xy + a_7\frac{x^2y}{2} + a_9\frac{y^2}{2} + a_{11}\frac{y^3}{6} + a_{12}\frac{y}{2}
$$
\n(1b)\n
$$
\beta_y = a_3 + a_6\frac{x^2}{2} + a_7\frac{x^3}{6} + a_8y + a_9xy + a_{10}\frac{y^2}{2} + a_{11}\frac{xy^2}{2} + a_{12}\frac{x}{2}
$$

$$
(1c)
$$



**Figure 2: Geometry of the Rectangular plate element SBRPK**

# **2.2 Membrane element (SBRIE)**

The rectangular element SBRIE (Strain- Based Rectangular In-plane Element) [17] with two degrees of freedom  $(u_i, v_i)$  at each of the four corner nodes is schematically shown in Fig.3

The displacement field:

$$
\begin{cases}\nU = a_1 - a_3y + a_4x + a_5xy - a_7\frac{y^2}{2} + a_8\frac{y}{2} \\
V = a_2 + a_3x - a_5\frac{x^2}{2} + a_6y + a_7xy + a_8\frac{x}{2}\n\end{cases}
$$
\n(2)



**Figure 3: SBRIE element and coordinate system.**

#### **3 Numerical examples**

The performance of this element **SBRPK-SBRIE** is estimated through a series of standard tests to show the use of the strain model.

The numerical results of several elements are used and compared with those obtained from this element and they are listed as follows:

**SBH8:** strain based hexahedron 8-node, is a three-dimensional element having eight nodes and 24 degrees of freedom, that is formulated for the analysis of thin and thick plates [7].

**SBRP:** strain based rectangular plate bending element, with 4 nodes and 12 degrees of freedom used for the analysis of thin and thick plates [8].

**SBRPK:** rectangular finite element for thin plate bending based on the strain approach with linear elastic behavior [9].

**SBRIE1:** the strain based rectangular in-plane element with an internal node [17].

**SBRIER:** The four nodes strain based rectangular in-plane element with an inplane rotation with 12 DOFs [4].

**ALLMAN:** Allman proposed a triangular element with vertex rotation (3- DOFs).[18].

**HEX20:** quadratic solid–shell elements [13].

**DKT18FR:** shell finite element with no degree of freedom of rotation [15].

**ACM-SBQ4:** A flat quadrilateral shell element proposed by Belarbi [11].

**ACM-RSBE5:** A rectangular flat shell finite element proposed by Hamadi [14].

#### **3.1 The patch tests for plate bending and plane membrane elements**

Since the parent plate and membrane components can strictly pass all patch tests for plate and membrane elements, respectively, the resulting flat shell element SBRPK-SBRIE can also pass these tests.

#### **3.1.1 Square plate bending problem**

To assess the proposed element's correctness, a simply supported plate with a central point load is analysed (fig 4). The plate considered has aspect ratios  $L/h=100$ . This example has been studied by several authors ([9], [8], [7].and [19]).

The plate is made of isotropic material with a constant thickness of 0.2 in and length of 20. The material properties, we have:  $P=1$ ,  $v=0.3$  and  $E=10^6$ .

Table 1 shows the obtained results. These values are calculated using the use of different meshes. It can be observed that the convergence is monotone. The SBRIE-SBRPK element has a 1.33 percent inaccuracy when compared to the analytical value. This result shows the good performance of this element.



**Figure.4: Geometry of the plate**





# **3.1.2 Mac-Neal's elongated cantilever beam**

The problems are presented to validate this element(SBRIE-SBRPK) . has been treated by Mac-Neal [20].The geometrical and materials characteristics of the structure are shown in Fig(5).

The results presented in Table 2 show that this element gives better results than all other elements (SBRIEIR, SBRIE1 and SBRIE).



**Figure 5: An elongated thin cantilever beam subjected to end shear**



**Figure 6: Example of mesh division**

# **Table 2: Normalized deflection at point A, of a thin cantilever beam under shear**



# **3.1.3 Short cantilever beam of Allman**

The short cantilever beam is subjected to a uniform vertical load (fig 7).is a standard problem to test finite element accuracy. The parameters are shown in figure 7.

The results presented in Table 3 show that the SBRIE-SBRPK element gives the most accurate results than the other elements , the error is reduced to : 5.206 %



**Figure 7: Cantilever beam under a tip load**





# **3.2 Clamped cylindrical shell with rigid diaphragm**

The problem to be considered is that of a clamped cylindrical shell, as shown in Fig(8), which is supported by two rigid diaphragms and is subjected to two concentrated forces, is a standard problem for evaluating the performance of the thin shell element  $(R/h=100)$  in a bending-dominated problem with complex membrane and inextensible bending. Only 1/8 (ABCD) is examined due to the cylinder's symmetry. The symmetry conditions are:  $W = \theta_Y = \theta_X = 0$  at AB,  $V = \theta_X = \theta_Z = 0$  at BC and  $U = \theta_Y = \theta_Z = 0$  at CD. The boundary condition:  $U = W = \theta_Y = 0$  at AD. Geometry and properties are indicated in Fig 8.b The results of this analysis are compared to the analytical solution based on the thin shell structures (R/h=100) given by Flugge [22] and Lindberg *et al* [23] below:

 $WC = -WC Eh/P = 164$ , 24 deflection under load P in point C only

The numerical results for this element SBRPK-SBRIE are compared with the reference solution, and numerical results reported in the literature of elements HEX20, DKT18FR, ACM-SBQ4 and ACM-RSBE5 (Table 4)

From the results obtained and shown in Table 4, the finest mesh used for the HEX20 element (20x4); the error obtained is 32.5%, the DKT18RF element (6x6); the error obtained is 8.6 %, the ACM-SBQ4 element (20x4); the error obtained is 4.4% and the ACM-RSBE5 element (20x4); the error obtained is 1.6% ,while that of this element (8x8) is 0.9, which represents an excellent performance of developed element.

The results obtained by element SBEPK-SBRIE show a monotonous convergence of displacement and agree well with the analytical solution. This result shows the good performance of this element.

Mesh	$W_C$ (Normalized value)							
	HEX20	DKT18RF	ACM-SBQ4	<b>ACM-RSBE5</b>	<b>SBRPK-SBRIE</b>			
4x4	0.140	0.763	0.618	0.649	1.183			
6x6	0.328	0.914	0.821	0.842	1.11			
8x8	0.523		0.904	0.955	1.009			
20x4	0.675		0.956	0.984				
Analytical solution	164.24							

**Table 4: Clamped cylindrical shell, convergence of WC**



**Figure 8: Clamped cylindrical shell**

# **3.3 Pinched cylinder with free edges**

In this example, a pinched cylinder with free edge is studied. The geometry and material properties are given in Fig (9). By reason of symmetries, Only (1/8) of the shell is studied by the element SBRPK-SBREI with different types of mesh.

The results of the SBRPK-SBRIE element (Table 5) are compared with the reference solution [20] with the other finite elements available in the literature. The results for deflections for the refined mesh  $(1x9)$  are in good agreement with an accurate reference solution.



# **Figure 9: Pinched cylinder with free edges**

**Table 5: Pinched cylinder with free edges, convergence of WC**

Mesh	$W_C$								
	$[24]$	$[25]$	DKT18RF	ACM-	ACM-	SBRPK-			
				SBQ4	RSBE5	<b>SBRIE</b>			
1x1	0.0025		2.75	0.0860	0.08763	1.57			
1x3	0.1026	0.0297	0.7255	0.1041	0.1060	0.2387			



# **4 Conclusions**

The formulation of a flat rectangular thin shell element called SBRPK-SBRIE based upon the strain approach has been successfully developed and presented in this paper, is proposed by the combination of SBRIE membrane element and SBRPK plate bending element. Both are founded on a strain based formulation. The proposed flat shell element's performance is evaluated using a set of numerical benchmark problems. Numerical results obtained using the new element show its good performance in terms of accuracy and rate of convergence to the reference solutions for all tests. The shell elements resulting from this combination are robust, competitive and efficient. The performances of the SBRPK-SBRIE element have been demonstrated. This element can easily be coded up and integrated in to research/commercial soft-ware.

# **References**

[1] Turner M.J., Clough R.W., Martin H.C. and Topp L.J., Stiffness and deflection analysis of complex structures, J. of Aeron. Sci.,Vol. 23, pp. 805-824, 1956.

[2] Ashwell D.G. and Sabir A.B., Limitations of certain curved finite elements when applied to arches, IJMS Vol. 13, pp. 133-139, 1971.

[3] Sabir A.B., A new class of Finite Elements for plane elasticity problems,CAFEM 7th , Int. Conf. Struct. Mech. in Reactor Technology, Chicago, 1983.

[4] Sabir A.B.,"A rectangular and triangular plane elasticity element with drilling degrees of freedom" Chapter 9 in proceeding of the 2nd international conference on variational methods in engineering, Southampton University, SpringerVerlag, Berlin, pp.1725.1985.

[5] Belarbi M.T & Maalem .T « On improved rectangular finite element for plane linear elasticity analysis, Revue Européenne des Éléments, 14:8, 985-997 [6] Hamadi D., Ashraf A. and Toufik M "A new strain-based finite element for plane elasticity problems" Engineering Computations, Vol. 33 Iss: 2, pp.562 - 579; 2016

[7] Belarbi M.T et Charif A.,**"**Développement d'un nouvel élément hexaédrique simple basé sur Le modèle en déformation pour l'étude des plaques minces et épaisses", Revue Européenne des Eléments Finis, Vol.8, N0 2, pp. 135157, 1999 [8] Belounar L and Guenfoud M,"A New Rectangular finite element based on the strain approach for plate bending",Thin Walled Structures 43 (2005) 4763 [9] Abderramani Sifeddine, Maalem Toufik and Hamadi Djamal (2016): On improved Thin Plate Bending Rectangular Finite Element Based on the Strain Approach. International Journal of Engineering Research in Africa, ISSN: 1663-4144, Vol.27, pp 76-86, Trans Tech Publications, Switserland. Doi: 10.4028/www.scientific.net/JERA.27.76

[10] Abderramani Sifeddine, Maalem Toufik and Hamadi Djamal (2018): The Transverse Shear Effect of a New Plate Bending Finite Element Based on the Strain Approach. International Journal of Engineering Research in Africa, ISSN: 1663-4144, Vol.35, pp 01-10, Trans Tech Publications, Switserland. Doi: 10.4028/www.scientific.net/JERA.35.1

[11] Belarbi M.T., Développement de nouveaux éléments finis à modèle en déformation, application linéaire et non linéaire. Thèse de doctorat, Université de Constantine, Février 2000. 235 pages

[12] Mousa A.I et M.H. El Naggar **«** Shallow Spherical Shell Rectangular Finite Element for Analysis of Cross Shaped Shell Roof » Electronic Journal of Structural Engineering, 7(2007)

[13] Abed-Meraim, F., Trinh, V., and Combescure, A. (2013). New quadratic solid–shell elements and their evaluation on linear benchmark problems. Computing 95:373–394.

[14] Hamadi D., Ashraf A. and Ounis A" A new flat shell finite element for the linear analysis of thin shell structures" European Journal of Computational Mechanics,Vol. 24 Iss: 6, pp.232-255, Mars 2016

[15] Bachir Labiodh, Djamal Hamadi and Abdallah Zatar. Development of a rotation free shell finite element for modeling shell structures. Engineering Solid Mechanics 8 (2020) 151-162

[16] Maalem.T « Contribution du modèle en déformation dans l'analyse des » thèse de doctorat, 2007

[17] Sabir A.B, Sfendji A, Triangular and rectangular plane elasticity finite element, Thin-Walled Structures 21 (1995) 225–232.

[18] Allman DJ (1984) A compatible triangular element including vertex rotations for plane elasticity analysis. Comput Struct 19:1–8

[19] Timoshenko S, Woinowsky-Krieger S. Theory of plates and shells. London: McGraw-Hill; 1959

[20] Mac-Neal R.H, Harder R.L, A proposed standard set of problems to test finite element accuracy, Finite Element in Analysis and Design 11 (1985) 3–20.

[21] Timoshenko S, J.N. Goodier, Theory of Elasticity, 2nd ed., McGraw-Hill, New York, 1951.

[22] Flugge W. and Fosberge K. (1966). Point load on shallow elliptic paraboloid. J. Appl. Mech., (33): 575-585.

[23] Lindberg G.M., Olson M.D. and Cowper G.R. (1969). New development in the finite element analysis of shells. Q. Bull Div. Mech. Eng. and Nat. Aeronautical Establishment, National Research council of Canada, Vol. 4.

[24] Bogner F.K., Fox R.L. and Schmit L.A. (1967). A cylindrical Shell Discrete Element, AIAA Journal, Vol. 5,  $N^{\circ}$  4, pp. 745-750.

[25] Cantin G. and Clouth R.W. (1968). A curved cylindrical shell Finite Element, AIAA Journal, Vol. 6, N° 6, pp. 1057-1062.

[26] Shang Y, Cen S, Li CF (2016) A 4-node quadrilateral flat shell element formulated by the shape-free HDF plate and HSF membrane elements. Eng Comput 33:713–741

[27] [Guenfoud Hamza,](https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Guenfoud-Hamza-2?_sg%5B0%5D=LQXmk-nRYxJiBLj-L9falPCby5G1Y1ahRwWNQu9UHdAnorqI-wJnDITnt4TMwqLIwFXyx0g.k63Kz7t9Z61a_35wbvTEZ1XLwoMDvWgrShadgOBtG43TNJUb5Isy1sfLtysyFnor6U0K_NQQAgRJMNjwZ7FIYA&_sg%5B1%5D=iqih56o-_J6pb-8b5hAtHgJtwD-OtKw3_jDFmmeB_lN-b-H0eJ6QJw0p4cYwqZn5ZWq12Ik.VmlozS1F2ZdmohDp-5HX5X_453RPlXHtcxTMu4zGGNhhJxQ5z3PYApdfXI1XjRXv0uufie1BZGzaVO-ucvwp7w) [Mohammed Himeur,](https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Mohammed-Himeur?_sg%5B0%5D=LQXmk-nRYxJiBLj-L9falPCby5G1Y1ahRwWNQu9UHdAnorqI-wJnDITnt4TMwqLIwFXyx0g.k63Kz7t9Z61a_35wbvTEZ1XLwoMDvWgrShadgOBtG43TNJUb5Isy1sfLtysyFnor6U0K_NQQAgRJMNjwZ7FIYA&_sg%5B1%5D=iqih56o-_J6pb-8b5hAtHgJtwD-OtKw3_jDFmmeB_lN-b-H0eJ6QJw0p4cYwqZn5ZWq12Ik.VmlozS1F2ZdmohDp-5HX5X_453RPlXHtcxTMu4zGGNhhJxQ5z3PYApdfXI1XjRXv0uufie1BZGzaVO-ucvwp7w) [Hassina Ziou](https://www.researchgate.net/scientific-contributions/Hassina-Ziou-2191883394?_sg%5B0%5D=LQXmk-nRYxJiBLj-L9falPCby5G1Y1ahRwWNQu9UHdAnorqI-wJnDITnt4TMwqLIwFXyx0g.k63Kz7t9Z61a_35wbvTEZ1XLwoMDvWgrShadgOBtG43TNJUb5Isy1sfLtysyFnor6U0K_NQQAgRJMNjwZ7FIYA&_sg%5B1%5D=iqih56o-_J6pb-8b5hAtHgJtwD-OtKw3_jDFmmeB_lN-b-H0eJ6QJw0p4cYwqZn5ZWq12Ik.VmlozS1F2ZdmohDp-5HX5X_453RPlXHtcxTMu4zGGNhhJxQ5z3PYApdfXI1XjRXv0uufie1BZGzaVO-ucvwp7w) and [Mohamed](https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Mohamed-Guenfoud?_sg%5B0%5D=LQXmk-nRYxJiBLj-L9falPCby5G1Y1ahRwWNQu9UHdAnorqI-wJnDITnt4TMwqLIwFXyx0g.k63Kz7t9Z61a_35wbvTEZ1XLwoMDvWgrShadgOBtG43TNJUb5Isy1sfLtysyFnor6U0K_NQQAgRJMNjwZ7FIYA&_sg%5B1%5D=iqih56o-_J6pb-8b5hAtHgJtwD-OtKw3_jDFmmeB_lN-b-H0eJ6QJw0p4cYwqZn5ZWq12Ik.VmlozS1F2ZdmohDp-5HX5X_453RPlXHtcxTMu4zGGNhhJxQ5z3PYApdfXI1XjRXv0uufie1BZGzaVO-ucvwp7w)  [Guenfoud](https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Mohamed-Guenfoud?_sg%5B0%5D=LQXmk-nRYxJiBLj-L9falPCby5G1Y1ahRwWNQu9UHdAnorqI-wJnDITnt4TMwqLIwFXyx0g.k63Kz7t9Z61a_35wbvTEZ1XLwoMDvWgrShadgOBtG43TNJUb5Isy1sfLtysyFnor6U0K_NQQAgRJMNjwZ7FIYA&_sg%5B1%5D=iqih56o-_J6pb-8b5hAtHgJtwD-OtKw3_jDFmmeB_lN-b-H0eJ6QJw0p4cYwqZn5ZWq12Ik.VmlozS1F2ZdmohDp-5HX5X_453RPlXHtcxTMu4zGGNhhJxQ5z3PYApdfXI1XjRXv0uufie1BZGzaVO-ucvwp7w) (2018) A consistent triangular thin flat shell finite element with drilling rotation based on the strain approach, International Journal of Structural Engineering 9(3):191.

[28] Hosein Sangtarash, Hamed Ghohani Arab, Mohammad Reza Sohrabi and Mohammad Reza Ghasemi (2019) Formulation and evaluation of a new four-node quadrilateral element for analysis of the shell structures, Engineering [with Computers](https://link.springer.com/journal/366) volume 36, pages 1289–1303.

[29] [Hosein Sangtarash,](https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s40430-020-02420-4#auth-Hosein-Sangtarash) [Hamed Ghohani Arab,](https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s40430-020-02420-4#auth-Hamed-Ghohani_Arab) [Mohammad R.](https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s40430-020-02420-4#auth-Mohammad_R_-Sohrabi)  [Sohrabi](https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s40430-020-02420-4#auth-Mohammad_R_-Sohrabi) & [Mohammad R. Ghasemi](https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s40430-020-02420-4#auth-Mohammad_R_-Ghasemi) (2020) An efficient three-node triangular Mindlin–Reissner flat shell element, [Journal of the Brazilian Society of](https://link.springer.com/journal/40430)  [Mechanical Sciences and Engineering,](https://link.springer.com/journal/40430) **42**, Article number: 328 .